The Action Cluster ‘Citizen Focus’ welcomes you to the webinar on

Collaborative Platforms to enable Participatory Budgeting initiatives

6 December 2017
12:30 – 14:00 CET
In order to ensure the **proper functioning** of the system and a **noise-free** presentation, we kindly ask all the participants to respect the following rules:

- Please disable your camera and microphone
  
  *Click on the icons to turn off these settings*

- To ask questions, use the chat located in the bottom right corner. We will be collecting your answer **during the speakers’ presentations** and answer in the Q&A session.

  *You can find the chat icon on the top right side of the screen*
10’ Introduction:
Explanation of structure and organisation of the webinar by Anne Deltour, European Commission, DG Connect

A brief introduction given by Maria Sangiuliano, AC Leader for Citizen Focus, on PB as a tool for implementing the Inclusive Smart Cities Manifesto

60’ Presentation:
1) Mr. Secchi – A conceptual framework for PB collaborative tools
2) Mr. Catania – Consul platform
3) Mr. Silva – Participare platform

15’ Q&A:
During the Webinar you are invited to use the chat to write questions to the presenters. Questions will be gathered and posed to presenters during the dedicated Q&A session.

5’ Wrap Up:
Anne Deltour, European Commission, DG Connect
Maria Sangiuliano
CEO & co-founder of Smart Venice srl
Action Cluster Leader
maria.sangiuliano@smart-venice.it
• All citizens’ voices, needs, concerns and capabilities starting and core points in Smart Cities and Communities
• From top down and purely tech driven planning to citizens’ dialogue and empowerment
• Leverage to increase **trust**
Our two main goals as an Action Cluster

- **Strengthening local political support** and commitment towards citizens’ centred and citizens’ driven smart communities

- Providing cities with practical **tools, guidelines and methods**

3 +1 main Initiatives or Actions
• A Manifesto co-created with 70 stakeholders and signed by 150 organisations
• **Manifesto goes local:** available in 12 languages
• Mapping citizen engagement implementation in Europe and selecting and engaging cities: our [survey](#)
• 3 Ambassador Cities (Glasgow, Utrecht and Leeds) committed to share their best practices and disseminate the Manifesto nationally. More to be selected by Spring 2018
• **To endorse the Manifesto on line**
Manifesto. A integrated value proposition for reachout.

A learning-self assessment and decision making tool. Toolkit.

Crosscutting GDPR Guidelines & Standards

Piloting a specific engagement method via on line platforms: PB
• To foster knowledge sharing drawing on EU and international good practices with focus on processes and challenges, skills and capacities which needs to be mobilized at the City Administration level, to conduct Participatory Budget in collaboration with local civil societies

• To disseminate existing online platforms highlighting business models, their strengths and weaknesses

• To explore methods and models of integration between PB and other areas of intervention which are particularly relevant for Smart Cities

• To offer capacity building to cities interested into piloting PB in a Smart City framework

• To integrate PB among actions to be included in the eGov Action Plan from the EC
PB as booster: Applying PB in Smart City specific domains to enhance citizen engagement

PB as orchestrator: Integrating participatory tools and methods developed within Smart Policies toward a multichannel participatory system
• More webinars to come

• Memorandum of Understanding on PB platforms

• One workshop in Bruxelles with city representatives actively promoting smart mobility/energy efficiency projects on a thematic-smart city application of Participatory Budgeting

• Defining scenario for piloting PB within Smart Cities Projects
EMPATIA seeks to radically enhance the inclusiveness and impact of the participation of citizens in public decision making processes, focusing on Participatory Budgeting as a paradigmatic example of Digital Democratic Innovation.

- **Research** on Digital Democratic Innovations and Participatory Budgeting;
- **Collaborative platform** for PB management;
- **Pilot Cities** in Portugal, Czech Republic, Italy, Germany;
- **Dissemination** of the key findings and the technology itself

The EMPATIA experimental platform will be released under GNU AGPL 3.0 license. (Alpha version released on github in Jan 2017)
Democratic Innovations (DIs): “institutions that have been specifically designed to increase and deepen citizen participation in the political decision making process” (Smith, 2009).

Participatory Budgeting (PB): a Democratic Innovation which entrusts non-elected citizens to decide how to allocate part of a municipal budget.
IN ALL CONTINENTS TODAY WE HAVE PBs

3000 are those known

Source: Learning from the South, 2010, GIZ- Bonn
PB in Portugal (2017)

National Level (2017)

PRESUPUESTO PARTICIPATIVO
PORTUGAL (OPP)

PRESUPUESTO PARTICIPATIVO
PARA ESCUELAS

PRESUPUESTO PARTICIPATIVO
PARA LA CIENCIA

SUSPENSOS
ACTIVOS
• History, diffusion and digitisation
• Appeal (talking about money!)
• Structured Institutional Design
• Iteration and «rites» (foster its centrality with respect to other Dis)
• Exemplary tension between Patterns/Models vs Infrastructuring
• Interdisciplinary Literature
1) Explicitly discussing public expenditures;
2) Having a structured (not necessarily formally) deliberative procedure;
3) Coinciding with an institutional responsibility of the Local Authorities in charge for public budgeting, generally a Municipality;
4) Having some degree of co-decision that makes the outcomes of PB binding for public decision-making;
5) Giving feedbacks to citizens over the implementation of PB outcomes in public policies.
Every PB process is a simple sequence of steps:

1. Participatory Meetings
   - Out-Nov 2014

2. Collection of proposals
   - Out-Nov 2014

3. Technical analysis of feasibility
   - Nov-Dez 2014

4. Vote on projects
   - Jan-Fev 2015

5. Public presentation of results
   - Fev 2015

6. Implementation of approved projects
   - 2015
Institutional Design 2

**Volontari**

**Campionone Rappresentativo**

**Stakeholders**

**Informazione & Dibattito**

**Delegati**

**Informazione & Dibattito**

**Progetti**

**Proposte**

**Priorità**

**Sostegno**

**Delegati**

**Progetti**

**Valutazione**

**Co-Design**

**Progetti**

**Voto Finale**

**Monitoraggio**
Collaborative Platforms for PB
The implementation of a digital PB process requires a number of core functions necessary to carry out the standard phases of a PB process.

- Collection of ideas/proposals → Form online and eventually collaborative writing features

- Filtering/technical analysis → Generally delivered offline, this stage requires backend features for task management (and flow design)

- Selection → Voting features

- Monitoring → Open publishing features
• **Analytics:** Automated analytics on the results of the PB process
• **Authentication:** Registration and authentication of users
• **Community tools:** social networking features (ie possibility create connections between users not necessarily linked to the structured deliberative process)
• **Content Management System (CMS):** Publication of pages, news, events
• **Design:** Possibility to design/configure via backend the deliberative procedure of PB (ie the sequence of phases that leads to the final result)
• **Events:** creation of events, ticketing (Eventbrite-like)
• **Kiosks:** control kiosks/machines/tablets for in-person participation
• **Monitoring:** features to monitor the implementation of the results of previous PB editions
• **Notify:** notification system
• **Open Data:** import/export and publication of data regarding the process in open standard format and licenses
• **Proposals:** collaborative writing of proposals
• **Questionnaire:** administer surveys
• **Vote:** configure and manage voting sessions
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Platform Name</th>
<th>Grant type, if any</th>
<th>What kind of deployment is it possible?</th>
<th>Analytics</th>
<th>Authentication</th>
<th>Community</th>
<th>Content Management System (CMS)</th>
<th>Design</th>
<th>Events</th>
<th>Kiosks</th>
<th>Monitoring</th>
<th>Notify</th>
<th>Open Data: Proposals</th>
<th>Vote</th>
<th>Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DemocracyOS</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OpenDCN</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AppCivist</td>
<td>YES, Public</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placespeak</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pol.is</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OpaVote</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changify</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Neighbourhood</td>
<td>YES, Public Public</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your priorities</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loomio</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenbudget</td>
<td>YES, Public</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberopinion</td>
<td>YES, Public Public</td>
<td>SaaS + All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgetparticipatif.paris.fr/bp/</td>
<td>YES, Public Public</td>
<td>All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider.it</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participare</td>
<td>NONE</td>
<td>SaaS</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consul</td>
<td>YES, Public Public</td>
<td>All-in-one</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organisation</td>
<td>What is the web server?</td>
<td>Development framework</td>
<td>Programming language (main)</td>
<td>Scripting language</td>
<td>Licence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DemocracyOS</td>
<td>Cowboy</td>
<td>Bootstrap</td>
<td>Erlang</td>
<td>Node.js</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OpenDCN</td>
<td>Apache</td>
<td>Bootstrap</td>
<td>PHP</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AppCivist</td>
<td>Apache</td>
<td>Angular</td>
<td>JavaScript</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placespeak</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Django</td>
<td>Python</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pol.is</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>React</td>
<td>JavaScript</td>
<td>D3</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OpaVote</td>
<td>Google App engine</td>
<td>Bootstrap</td>
<td>JavaScript</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changify</td>
<td>Apache</td>
<td>Fat-Free</td>
<td>PHP</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>My Neighbourhood</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Drupal 7</td>
<td>PHP</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Your priorities</td>
<td>Cowboy</td>
<td>Polymer</td>
<td>Erlang</td>
<td>Node.js</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loomio</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Angular</td>
<td>JavaScript</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenbudget</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Mustache</td>
<td>Ruby</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberoopinion</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Angular</td>
<td>JavaScript</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budgetparticipatif.paris.fr/bp/</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Bootstrap</td>
<td>Java</td>
<td>Jquery</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consider.it</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>React</td>
<td>Ruby</td>
<td>Javascript</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participare</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Laravel</td>
<td>PHP</td>
<td>Javascript</td>
<td>Close Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consul</td>
<td>Nginx</td>
<td>Zurb Foundation</td>
<td>Ruby</td>
<td>Javascript (Phantom JS)</td>
<td>Open Source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Application & Integration
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SAAS</th>
<th>LOCAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FLOSS</td>
<td>empatia-project.eu</td>
<td>Consul - decide.es</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NON FLOSS</td>
<td>partecipare.io</td>
<td>budgetparticipatif.paris.fr</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Main features of ‘Participare’
• Technical analysis of the platform
• License
• Deployment method
Communication

- Multilingue
- News
- Messaging
- Full control of labels & texts

Security

- Authentication options
- Anti-fraud algorithms
- Auditing
- Integration with third parties (MAI,..)

Voting

- 1 step Vote & register process
- Different voting methods (single/multiple/weighted/ranked)
- Voting restrictions (age & region)
- Offline votes (to offline digital and paper voting)
Other engagement features

- Proposal submission
- Proposal promotion
- Comments
- Support (like)
- Sharing

Tech analysis features

- Responsible definition
- Report registration

Statistics

- By project
- By day
- Feedback
- etc.
Process control

- Details
- Schedule
- Participation parameters
- Proposal admission / upload
- Comment moderation

Platform configuration

- Registration fields
- User validation conditions
- Security list configuration
- Inappropriate terms
Marketing
Communication
Project Promotion
Community
Full Process Control
Different Voting Methods
Easy register & vote
Branding

Full Process Control

Registration Control

Offline Integration

Different Voting Methods

Messaging
Developed in PHP & PostgreSQL
  • Using Laravel and AngularJS
  • HTML5

Responsive

Available in Cloud
  • No hosting
• Available in Cloud – Software as a Service (SaaS)

• **FREE for up to 100 participants & 1 process**

• **FREE for Schools**

• 5000 €/year for unlimited processes & 20.000 registered participants
  • Other prices available considering currency and local discount agreements
  • Includes:
    • Platform
    • Hosting
    • Support
    • 1 day remote training
• 1 minute deployment
• Up to 30 minutes to customise image and texts
• Our support helps!
Q&A SESSION
Many questions were addressed to our speakers – here below you may find the most relevant ones.
Should you wish to listen to all the questions and/or for fully detailed answers, please refer to the webinar video.

• **Addressed to Michelangelo Secchi**

1) What are the links between PB and Crowdfunding? *The link is not common – the point of friction between the two is represented by the different implementation process for both tools.*

2) What is the political bias towards cities that elect to adopt PB? *Some political movements are more keen than others to promoting PB activities. The various models of PB remain, however, quite independent.*
3) What are the critical success factors for PB and what are the most common failures? *The critical factor for success is the capacity of adapting to specific challenges.*

• **Addressed to Miguel Arana Catania**

1) Are voters somehow biased by other people’s votes or is the voting system closed? *The voting system is closed to avoid bias.*

2) What percentage of the population does the “Decide Madrid” platform represent? What are the social and age ranges of people using the platform? *Over 40% and it is growing quite fast. Users’ social and age range is quite compliant with Madrid’s demographics.*
3) How is people’s identity verified? *Identity can be verified through a database and/or through a personal code that gets sent to their phones upon registering and/or people can get their identity personally verified in City Council offices.*

- **Addressed to Cesar Silva**

1) What are three critical factors for PB success? *Political support, promotion and restricted participation.*

2) How is paper voting managed and who enters data afterwards? *Usually someone from the Municipality or from the organisation – most of which, working as volunteers.*

3) Who is authorised to put “likes”? *You must be registered in order to do so.*
Two additional webinars will complete our series of three in early 2018

- The second webinar will focus on **the role of policy makers** in Participatory Budgeting
- The third and final webinar will evaluate **strengths and weaknesses** of Participatory Budgeting
Our Management Team

• **Maria Sangiuliano**
  Action Cluster Chair – contact: maria.sangiuliano@smart-venice.it

• **Roberta Maio**
  Action Cluster Manager – contact: roberta.maio@pwc.com

• **Anne Deltour**
  European Commission Official – contact: anne.deltour@ec.europa.eu
Thank you for your attention!